

# theory, data, and model selection

---

## intro

---

### caveats

(“so let me start with warnings and disclaimers”)

1. warning: i am not a population geneticist
2. disclaimer: i will likely not talk about **any** of my own work.
3. “informal” talk, please ask questions

### statement of the problem:

1. quest for “truthiness” / using data to select best model
2. examples
  - I. comparing models: neutral, neutral+mutation, neutral+selection, neutral+migration+sweeping
  - II. comparing # features: 50 sites, N-50 hitchhikers, 100 sites, N-100 hitchhikers, N sites 0 hitchhikers?
3. key ideas
  - I.  $x^2$  ergo ML ergo ME (jets)
  - II. prediction ergo CV (sharks)
4. when would this be a bad idea? example: NN-regression
  - I. good models are predictive [but/and]
  - II. good models are interpretable

## basic bayesian notions

---

1. context + historical digression: who was this bayes  
[[http://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/en/d/d4/Thomas\\_Bayes.gif](http://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/en/d/d4/Thomas_Bayes.gif)] troublemaker?
2. what bayes said: “the product rule”
3. (as opposed to “the sum rule”)
4. examples of what happens when you put product and sum together
  - I. diffusion
  - II. likelihood with additive and normal noise
  - III. behold: why we fit

## bayesian model selection

---

1. if you believe in ML, why not MML=ME?

- I. plot of  $P(D|K)$
- II. being bayesian: parameters and priors
- III. payoff: BIC
  - a. WARNING: SKETCH OF DERIVATION LIKELY  
[<http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/BIC.tiff>]
  - b. “the razor”
  - c. “truthiness”
  - d. summary + swindles
  - e. elaboration on priors
    - $\alpha$ . gaussian priors (exact case for linear regression; restatement of ridge/Tychonoff regression)
    - $\beta$ . other priors: lasso, grouping, fusion, etc.
2. who is the most bayesian? bayes’ rule, etc.
3. a note on graphical models

## frequentist ideas / cross validation

---

1. modeling is about prediction, ergo minimize empirical estimate of generalization error.
2. fit (monotonic) & “truthiness” (peaked) plot
3. nature never hands you distributions, only observations (re:  $P(D|M)$ , BIC)

## illustration: mixture modeling

---

1. cf xing
2. cf sharply peaked
3. connection w/stat mech + test distributions + mean field theory + BP

## bayesian+variational

1. “EM” movie [[http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/jmh\\_gmm\\_demo.mov](http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/jmh_gmm_demo.mov)]
  - I. WARNING: SKETCH OF DERIVATION LIKELY  
[[http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/VB\\_examples.pdf](http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/VB_examples.pdf)]
    - a. gibbs=jensen=feynman inequality
    - b.  $\ln q(x) \propto -\ln p(D,z,t|a,b) - \sum x = dH/dq$
    - c.  $q = \exp(dH/dq)$
    - d.  $\langle H \rangle_{q} = H'$ 
      - $\alpha$ . recall, as you learned on your mother’s knee:  $m = \tanh(Jm/T)$
      - $\beta$ . cf section 33.3 of mackay’s book
2. “VB”/“ensemble learning”
  - I. E:  $q(z)$
  - II. M:  $q(t)$
  - III. Movie of VB in action [<http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/flyingGaussians1.avi>] for vector GMM

### 3. a note on graphical models

- |   |    |           |        |     |      |        |
|---|----|-----------|--------|-----|------|--------|
| I. gmm  | ML | graphical | model, | c/o | jake | hofman |
| [ <a href="http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/jmh_gmm_ml.pdf">http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/jmh_gmm_ml.pdf</a> ] |    |           |        |     |      |        |
| II. gmm   | ME | graphical | model, | c/o | jake | hofman |
| [ <a href="http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/jmh_gmm_me.pdf">http://www.columbia.edu/itc/applied/wiggins/Movies/jmh_gmm_me.pdf</a> ] |    |           |        |     |      |        |

## CV approach

(it works. discuss)

## pvalueology

---

1. how good is my CV?
2. how good is my likelihood
3. assumptions inherent
4. conventions inherent
5. multiple hypothesis testing

## alternative worldviews not mentioned in this talk

---

1. discriminative learning, SVM/hinge loss, boosting loss...
2. model selection via stability
3. sampling/MCMC/gibbs (vs variation)

## topics for penalty time

---

1. "data mining"
2. work on community detection as latent variable inference (inc. Hofman+Wiggins '08 [<http://arxiv.org/abs/0709.3512>])
3. deep thoughts: what is a model? what is a "good" model?

## references

---

### statistics books by physicists

---

1. mckay
2. bishop

### online references

---

1. beal's thesis on variational methods [<http://www.cse.buffalo.edu/faculty/mbeal/thesis/>]
2. yedidia's lecture notes [<http://www.merl.com/people/yedidia/santafe.pdf>]

### 3. wikipedia pages

- I. resampling statistics [[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Resampling\\_\(statistics\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Resampling_(statistics))]
- II. Gibbs sampling [[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gibbs\\_sampling](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gibbs_sampling)]
- III. Variational Bayes [[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Variational\\_Bayes](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Variational_Bayes)]
- IV. Bayes [[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Thomas\\_Bayes](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Thomas_Bayes)]
- V. Ridge/Tichinoff/Bayesian regression [[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ridge\\_regression](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ridge_regression)]

## misc papers

---

1. beal+ZG: vb vs other things [<http://learning.eng.cam.ac.uk/zoubin/papers/valencia02.pdf>]
2. more yedidia [<http://www.merl.com/reports/docs/TR2000-27.pdf>], on corrections to MFT
3. still more yedidia [<http://nerdwisdom.files.wordpress.com/2007/10/ja910924.pdf>], diagrammatica, less pedagogical.
4. mackay 1995: Probable networks and plausible predictions—a review of practical ... [<http://www.inference.phy.cam.ac.uk/mackay/network.pdf>],  $p(D|M)$  figure; truthiness plots, the whole shebang. 41 pages.
5. Schwarz 1978 [<http://www.math.tau.ac.il/~yekutiel/MA%20seminar/Schwarz%201978.pdf>]

## deep thoughts

---

1. share your code
2. "Everything should be made as simple as possible, but no simpler." [<http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/Einstein>]
3. "There is always an easy solution to every problem ,Äî neat, plausible and wrong" [[http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/H.\\_L.\\_Mencken](http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/H._L._Mencken)]
4. With four parameters I can fit an elephant, and with five I can make him wiggle his trunk. [[http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/John\\_von\\_Neumann](http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/John_von_Neumann)]

/Users/wiggins/Sites/dokuwiki/data/pages/kitp\_public.txt · Last modified: 2008/10/02 10:10 by wiggins